Reducing Implicit Bias - Cultural Humility
What is Racial Equity?

• The condition that would be achieved if race no longer predicted, in a statistical sense, how one fares.

• It is a part of racial justice that includes work to address root causes of inequities, not just their manifestation

• It includes the elimination of policies, practices, attitudes, and cultural messages that reinforce differential outcomes by race or fail to eliminate them

(Center for Assessment and Policy Development; Frank Porter Graham Race, Culture, and Ethnicity Committee)
• The statistical portrait of the US population broken out by race reveals persistent disparities between people of color and white people in almost every indicator of well-being.
Equality

The assumption is that everyone benefits from the same supports. This is equal treatment.

Equity

Everyone gets the supports they need (this is the concept of “affirmative action”), thus producing equity.

Justice

All 3 can see the game without supports or accommodations because the cause(s) of the inequity was addressed. The systemic barrier has been removed.
Defining Diversity, Inclusion, Equity
Racial Inequities
How Early Does Inequity Start?
BEFORE the Child is Born!
How Early Does Equity Start?

Black and Hispanic women experience higher rates of preterm birth, gestational diabetes, hypertension, fetal death, and stillbirths than white women (Zhang et al. 2013).
Inequities in Prenatal Care

Black women are significantly more likely to receive inadequate prenatal care during pregnancy compared to white women.

Reagan, Zhang, Zotti & Graham (2011)
Blacks, Hispanics, and women who are low income are less likely receive advice from their prenatal care providers about smoking cessation and alcohol use.

Maternal Mortality

Black women experience maternal deaths at three to four times that of White women regardless of socioeconomic status.

(American College of Obstetrician and Gynecologists, 2018)
Serena Williams’ Experience
Health Disparities

People of color are less likely to receive **preventive** medical treatments than whites and often receive **lower-quality** care.
 Longer Wait Times

• People of color
• People who have lower levels of education,
• Those who are unemployed
spend significantly longer time
waiting to obtain medical care, with
blacks and Latinos waiting 19 and
25 minutes more, respectively, than
white patients to see a doctor.
(National Center for Health Statistics, 2015)
Woman Who Sat For Hours In Hospital Wait Room With Chest Pain Dies After Leaving To Find Quicker Care

January 13, 2020 | By Charise Frazier
Six Aims for the Health Care System.

• Institute of Medicine (IOM), 2001
  • Safe
  • Effective
  • Patient-centered
  • Timely
  • Efficient
  • Equitable
IT’S ALL ABOUT RACE

After accounting for income, neighborhood, comorbid illnesses, and health insurance type, health outcomes for people of color, specifically African Americans, were still worse than whites. Inequities persist...
A recent Institute for Healthcare Improvement White Paper called equity “the forgotten aim,” noting how little progress has been made.
Equitable: Providing care that does not vary in quality because of gender, ethnicity, geographic location, and socioeconomic status.

Defining Equity

What is Health Equity?
The Centers for Disease Control (CDC) defines health equity as, “the opportunity to attain their full health potential and no one is disadvantaged from achieving this potential because of their social position or other socially determined circumstance.”
To reduce racial and ethnic health disparities, health care professionals must **explicitly acknowledge the roles of implicit bias and structural racism** in creating and perpetuating racial health disparities.
Implicit Bias
Health Professionals
Implicit Bias

Even though we believe we see and treat people as equals, hidden biases may still influence our perceptions and actions.

Source: Tolerance.Org
Implicit bias is the mental process resulting in feelings and attitudes about people based on race, age, and appearance.

It is an unconscious process and we are not consciously aware of the negative racial biases that develop over the course of our lifetime.

Implicit bias supports stereotypes.
Implicit Bias

- Implicit racial bias resides in our “unconscious mind,” the part of the brain that many researchers believe is beyond our direct control

- Unconscious attitudes are less egalitarian than what we explicitly think about race

- Our refusal to talk about and confront issues of race reinforces implicit racial bias

Tom Rudd, Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity
It is important to understand the **causes** of implicit racial bias and **intentionally** work to bring it to the conscious level in order to mitigate the negative consequences.
Implicit Bias: Aware is Halfway There
### Fathers’ Involvement
Involvement of fathers with activities of their children under age 5.

#### Fathers Living with Children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Hisp.</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Black</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fed or ate meals with children daily</td>
<td>63.9</td>
<td>73.9</td>
<td>78.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bathed, diapered or dressed children daily</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>70.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Played with children daily</td>
<td>74.1</td>
<td>82.7</td>
<td>82.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read to children daily</td>
<td>21.9</td>
<td>30.2</td>
<td>34.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Los Angeles Times National Center for Health Statistics
# Fathers Not Living With Children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Hisp.</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Black</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fed or ate meals with children</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>12.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>daily</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bathed, diapered or dressed</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>children daily</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Played with children daily</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>16.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read to children daily</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Los Angeles Times National Center for Health Statistics
Implicit Bias in Health Care

- Race,
- primary spoken language,
- gender,
- sexual orientation,
- education,
- employment status

are associated with implicit bias and differences in communication and treatment.
While there are inequities throughout our society. Today’s conversation is about RACE.
Peter Senge - from The Fifth Discipline

* Our beliefs affect what data we select next time.
A process by which we determine meaning about what is occurring around us. This process takes milliseconds to complete and we are often unaware that it is happening.

Ladder of Inference

- Directly observable data
- High Level Inference
- Low Level Inference
Rosemarie walks in and does not speak to me

I select data (Conscious/Unconscious)

I add meanings and labels (Personal/Cultural)

I make assumptions

I draw conclusions and take action based on my beliefs

High Level Inference

Low Level Inference

We will never be treated fairly by Rosemarie

Rosemarie thinks she is better than us

Rosemarie has an attitude and doesn’t like me.

Rosemarie rushes past me without speaking.

Directly Observable Data
Rosemarie walks in and does not speak to me.
My student won’t address me by “Ms.” in class.  

Directly Observable Data  

I notice that child did not use Ms. Allen to address me.  

I think this is disrespectful.  

I assume that she comes from a family that doesn’t value manners, education, or school very much.  

I make less of an effort to get to know this student as a person.  

I draw conclusions and take action based on my beliefs.  

I make assumptions.  

I add meanings and labels (Personal/Cultural).  

I select data (Conscious/Unconscious).  

Ladder of Inference

High Level Inference

Low Level Inference
High Level Inference

I draw conclusions and take action based on my beliefs ►

Low Level Inference

I make assumptions ►

I add meanings and labels ► (Personal/Cultural)

I select data ► (Conscious/Unconscious)

Directly Observable Data

Black woman comes to urgent care crying

Let's get this over with. She's not in that much pain. I'm not going to spend a lot of time with her.

She's probably acting to get pain medication

I've heard about hysterical black women

She's hysterically crying
By the time they are 7 years old, White children perceive that Black children feel less pain (Samarrai, 2014).
• By the time they are two years old, children show a strong preference for those in the same racial group (Baron & Banaji, 2006).

• 5–6 year old children in majority group show the same level of implicit bias as ‘in-group’ adults (Baron & Banaji, 2006)
Bias in Action

I’m sorry, sir, you are the least sick of all the people who are here,
We Must Talk About Race and Culture
Why Don’t We Want to Talk About Race?

“We have become so politically correct that we don’t know what to say and when to say it. We don’t know what to say to anyone anymore.”

Lee Jones, Florida State University.
We Don’t Know Each Other!
Hair Rules
Danger of Color-blind ideology
Racial blindness promotes the fallacy that people are beyond bias and racism, ignores racial disparities, and places blame on communities of color.
Cultural Humility

Challenges us to become the student, learning about those with whom we interact more personally, within a cultural context, suspending judgment.
I wish my teacher knew how much I miss my dad because he got deported to Mexico when I was 3 years old and I haven't seen him in 6 years. I wish my teacher knew.
What Do Your Patients Wish You Knew?
Cultural Humility Principles

- Lifelong learning and critical self-reflection
- Recognize and change power imbalances
- Develop mutually-beneficial partnerships
- Institutional accountability

(Vivian Chávez)
Practicing Cultural Humility

People bring their own experiences in dialogue with others

Practice active & deep listening

Be aware of body language

Know and own what you don’t know

Know your boundaries

Know when to ask for help

(Vivian Chávez)
Micro-affirmations
Micro-affirmations

• Subtle or apparently small acknowledgements of a person's value and accomplishments. They may take the shape of recognition of the person, "opening a door," referring positively to the work of a person, commending someone on the spot, or making a happy introduction.

Powell, Demetriou, & Fisher (2013)
Micro-affirmations

• Micro-affirmations substitute messages about deficit and exclusion with messages of excellence, openness, and opportunity that includes:
  • Active listening
  • Recognizing and validating experiences
  • Affirming emotional reactions

Powell, Demetriou, & Fisher (2013)
Active Listening

• Focuses on hearing clearly what is being shared, and demonstrated through eye contact, open body posture, summarizing statements, and/or asking qualifying questions to ensure understanding.

Powell, Demetriou, & Fisher (2013)
Recognizing and Validating Experiences

• Involves hearing the what, why, and how. It is helpful to delve deeper by identifying and validating the a patient, expressing care about the patient, and demonstrating a willingness to think through a productive path forward.

Powell, Demetriou, & Fisher (2013)
• Verbal acknowledgement that people have experienced something exciting, frustrating, hurtful, etc. enables the conversation to focus on turning those feelings toward actions that will empower, heal, and/or foster learning.

Powell, Demetriou, & Fisher (2013)
YOU Have the Power to Change Hearts to Change Practice